

Evaluation Committee Meeting  
18-19 March 2000  
Frankfurt am Main, Germany

Minutes

Present: Prof. G. M. Schneider (Chairman), Prof. J. Corish, Prof. E. Grzywa,  
Prof. O. M. Nefedov, Prof. U.K. Pandit, Prof. C.-G. Wermuth

Secretary: Dr. J. W. Jost

**1. Introduction and Finalization of the Agenda.**

The Chairman welcomed the members of the Committee and especially Prof. Nefedov who joined the Committee after the 1<sup>st</sup> Committee meeting during the IUPAC General Assembly in Berlin. He expressed his satisfaction that all Committee members (see IUPAC Handbook 2000 - 2001, p. 23) were present and thanked the Gesellschaft Deutscher Chemiker (GDCh) for having made available their offices for the meeting.

He then summarized the material that had been distributed before the present meeting, i.e.,

- the invitation with a draft agenda,
- the draft minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> EvC meeting in Berlin (see item 2),
- two e-mails of the Chairman containing organizational details,
- a collection of the material that has been submitted by the Division Presidents and IDCNS, prepared by the Secretariat (see item 5), and
- a list of projects completed (or abandoned), prepared by the Secretariat (see item 5).

The draft agenda was unanimously approved.

**2. Approval of the Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> EvC Meeting, held at Berlin, Germany, on 10 August 1999.**

The minutes of the meeting, held during the General Assembly in Berlin on 10 August 1999, were unanimously approved.

**3. Reports of Committee Chairman and Secretary.**

The Chairman reported on the presentation of the Committee activities at the Bureau Meeting in Berlin and the Secretary on the preparation of the present meeting.

**4. Introductory discussion (Terms of Reference etc.).**

The Terms of Reference of the EvC (see IUPAC Handbook 2000 - 2001, p. 276) and the tasks to be fulfilled at the present meeting were briefly discussed.

**5. Projects submitted for retrospective evaluation by the Division Presidents and Chairmen of Standing Committees.**

A compilation of the material submitted by the Presidents of Divisions I to VI as well as IDCNS in response to a request from the Committee, had been distributed before the present meeting by the IUPAC Secretariat. During the meeting, a project of Division VII was presented. The material and some strategies for the future EvC work were discussed in considerable detail. In addition a list was presented by the IUPAC Secretariat of projects completed (or abandoned) since the publication of the 'current projects 1998' listed in the IUPAC Handbook 1998 - 1999. This list will be of

Evaluation Committee Meeting  
Minutes

considerable interest for the organization of the future EvC work (see items 6 and 7) and was extensively discussed.

It was, however, decided not to make any evaluation on all these projects at the present meeting.

**6. Criteria to be applied in evaluating future projects:**

- 6.1. CONFORMANCE TO PLAN,**
- 6.2. IMPACT ON CHEMICAL COMMUNITY.**

These items are treated together with Item 7 below.

**7. Organization of the future EvC work.**

The discussion focussed on which projects to evaluate and what criteria to use. The projects submitted by the Division Presidents and Standing Committee Chairmen in response to a request from the Committee (see item 5) provided examples of the issues regarding evaluation criteria the Committee would need to deal with. The following points were agreed on.

- (i.) All projects completed since the 1998 - 1999 Handbook was printed, including the completed portions of ongoing projects, will be evaluated using standard measures.
- (ii.) Projects for more complete evaluation will be selected from this group.
- (iii.) The standard measures tabulated would be:
  - a) Duration
  - b) Result (*PAC*, book, co-publications, other)
  - c) Citations
  - d) Book sales
  - e) Hits on a web page
  - f) Number of people involved
  - g) Geographic diversity
  - h) Impacted community
- (iv.) The following statistical information would be calculated:
  - a) Average duration and duration histogram
  - b) Per cent abandoned
  - c) Average Hits, Citations, Book Sales
- (v.) A form is to be developed to be sent to the project leaders along with the funding letter and to be filled in and returned after completion of the project. The following points will be suggested for consideration:
  - a) Was there co-publication?
  - b) Are the evaluated data developed by this project incorporated in commercial databases?
  - c) Have the recommendations of this project been adopted by journals, textbook authors, other organizations?
  - d) Have there been articles in the scientific press on this project?

Evaluation Committee Meeting  
Minutes

- e) Have the standard methods proposed by this project been adopted by industrial or governmental organizations?
  - f) Does this data form the basis for standard models used in the field?
  - g) Does this project have, or could it have after suitable modification, industrial applications?
- (vi.) The Committee felt that CHEMRAWN conferences should be evaluated, including future action plans.
- (vii.) The Committee felt that for some projects requests should be made for evaluation by outside experts.

**8. Miscellaneous.**

The Chairman informed the Committee that he would be able to react only after his return from a trip to the US in April

**9. Date and Place of next EvC Meeting.**

The EvC will meet on Sunday afternoon, 24 September 2000, after the Bureau Meeting to be held in Guildford (south west of London), UK, on 23 and 24 September 2000. At this meeting, the statistical material to be provided in the interim by the Secretariat will be discussed and a selection of the projects to be evaluated at the Committee meeting in January 2001 will be made.

Prof. Wermuth invited the Committee for a full meeting on 19 and 20 January 2001 at Obernai, near Strasbourg, France. Here the evaluation of the projects selected in Guildford will be made in order to be able to submit a report early enough for the Bureau meeting to be held during the General Assembly in Brisbane, Australia, in 2001.

The Chairman thanked all Committee members and especially Dr. Jost and the Secretariat for the work done. He again expressed the thanks of the Committee to the Gesellschaft Deutscher Chemiker (GDCh) for their kind hospitality and closed the meeting.

Prepared by:

Prof. Gerhard M. Schneider      Dr. John W. Jost